

SECURITY COUNCIL RESOLUTIONS UNDER CHAPTER VII

Design, Implementation and Accountabilities

The Cases of Afghanistan, Côte d'Ivoire, Kosovo and Sierra Leone



SECURITY COUNCIL RESOLUTIONS UNDER CHAPTER VII

Design, Implementation and Accountabilities

The Cases of Afghanistan, Côte d'Ivoire, Kosovo and Sierra Leone

Blanca Antonini, *Editor*
Maud Edgren-Schori, *Gender Adviser*
Débora García-Orrico, *Kosovo*
Shahrbanou Tadjbakhsh, *Afghanistan*
Gilles Yabi, *Côte d'Ivoire and Sierra Leone*

Copyright © Fundación para las Relaciones Internacionales y el Diálogo Exterior (FRIDE) 2009.

All rights reserved.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form or by any electronic or mechanical means including information storage and retrieval systems, without prior written consent of the publisher.

ISBN: 978-84-613-4974-6

Legal Deposit:

The views expressed by the authors do not necessarily reflect the opinion of FRIDE. If you have any comments on this document or any other suggestions, please email us at fride@fride.org

For further information:

Goya, 5-7, Pasaje, 2^o planta.

28001. Madrid

Spain

Tel.: +34 912 44 47 40 - Fax: +34 912 44 47 41

Email: fride@fride.org

www.fride.org

Printed by: Priority Producción, Diseño y Comunicación S.L.

Printed in Spain

Security Council Resolutions Under Chapter VII

Contents

	CONTRIBUTORS	III	
	ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	VII	
	ACRONYMS	IX	
	FOREWORD	XIX	<Pierre Schori>
	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	XXIII	
1.	INTRODUCTION	I	<Blanca Antonini>
2.	AFGHANISTAN	24	<Shahrbanou Tadjbakhsh>
3.	CÔTE D'IVOIRE	86	<Gilles Yabi>
4.	KOSOVO	128	<Débora García-Orrico>
5.	SIERRA LEONE	168	<Gilles Yabi>
6.	CONCLUSION	210	<Blanca Antonini et. al>

Security Council Resolutions Under Chapter VII


CONTRIBUTORS

Blanca Antonini is a visiting professor at the Master's degree in International Relations of the Torcuato Di Tella University in Buenos Aires, Argentina, where she lectures on peacemaking and peacekeeping within the framework of the United Nations (UN). Blanca Antonini has had an extensive career at the UN in the area of peace and security. In such a capacity, she participated in peace negotiations in El Salvador and served in peacekeeping operations in Central America and in Kosovo. She was a member of the Joint Group established with the participation of representatives of the local parties and of the United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK) to formulate the Constitutional Framework for Provisional Self-Government Institutions and was the head of the UNMIK Office in Belgrade. Antonini has written several papers and contributed to various publications on UN-related issues, including the section on El Salvador in *The UN Security Council from the Cold War to the 21st Century*, published by Lynne Rienner in 2004.

Maud Edgren-Schori is a researcher and lecturer on Social Work at Stockholm University, Sweden, where she lectures about Social Policy, International Social Work and Human Rights in Social Work. Maud Edgren-Schori was deployed in Côte d'Ivoire as a gender adviser in 2005-2006 and is a member of the GenCap roster of gender advisers. GenCap is a project of the Sub-Working Group on Gender in Humanitarian Action of the Inter-Agency Standing Committee (IASC). As a GenCap gender adviser, she has been deployed in Liberia and is currently in Georgia. Edgren-Schori is the president of the National Committee of the United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM) in Sweden.

Déborá García-Orrico is an independent political consultant. She has spent most of her career at international organisations, mainly at the United Nations Secretariat (at headquarters and in the field) and the European Union (EU), but also at the Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) and the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). It is of particular relevance for this study her experience within the Interim Administration in Kosovo where she served, from 1999 until 2006, as political affairs officer in three of its four pillars.

Pierre Schori is director general of FRIDE. A Swedish diplomat with vast experience in foreign affairs, development cooperation and peacekeeping operations, Schori served from 2005 until the beginning of 2007 as Special Representative of the UN Secretary-General and Head of Mission in Côte d'Ivoire. Pierre Schori was minister for International Development Cooperation, Migration and Asylum Policy, and deputy foreign minister between 1994 and 1999. In 2000, Schori was appointed Swedish Ambassador to the United Nations, a position he held until 2004. He has also served as member of the Swedish Parliament and the European Parliament. He is chairperson of the Olof Palme Memorial



Fund and of Swedish ECPAT (End Child Prostitution, Child Pornography and Trafficking of Children for Sexual Purposes). Visiting professor at the Adelphi University, New York (2004-2005), Pierre Schori is author of several books including, most recently, *The Years of the Dragon's Teeth - September 11, the Iraq War and the World after Bush* (2008).

Shahrbanou Tadjbakhsh, PhD, is a researcher and professor on the subject of Human Security at L'Institut d'Etudes Politiques (Sciences Po) in Paris, France. Previously, she worked as a staff member of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) posted in Central Asia, the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS), Eastern Europe and New York. In addition to this project with FRIDE, her fieldwork on Afghanistan has included a participation in the 'Ethics of Liberal Peace' project of the Peace Research Institute of Oslo (PRIO), as well as a joint Sciences Po/University of Kabul project on 'Norms and Values of Liberal Peace'. She was the editor-in-chief of the first National Human Development Report in Afghanistan, entitled 'Security with a Human Face: Challenges and Responsibilities' (UNDP and Government of Afghanistan, 2005); is co-author of *Human Security, Concepts and Implication* (Routledge, 2007); and has written numerous publications on human security, peacebuilding, Tajikistan and Afghanistan.

Gilles Yabi is a researcher and independent consultant in the fields of conflict analysis, peacekeeping operations and political governance in West Africa. He was previously a senior political analyst with the West Africa project of the conflict prevention organisation International Crisis Group (ICG), where he was responsible for the policy reports on Côte d'Ivoire and Guinea. He also contributed to the research on conflict and instability in Liberia, Sierra Leone and the Sahel region. Before joining ICG, he worked as a journalist in a weekly magazine edited in Paris, specialising on African political and economic affairs. He holds a PhD in Development Economics and has published academic articles on the role of foreign direct investments in developing countries.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work is the result of expert research and extensive consultations with senior diplomats, officials of the United Nations (UN), independent experts, representatives of non-governmental organisations (NGOs), and citizens of the countries that hosted the peace operations under review. Answers to the questions posed were crucial to enrich and give special meaning to the findings of the research work. Their insights served to broaden our understanding of the underlying realities at the Security Council, in the capitals and on the ground that most influenced the peace operations in Afghanistan, Côte d'Ivoire, Kosovo and Sierra Leone. In addition, they contributed to shed more light on the scope and limits of the UN Secretariat's support for the peace missions.

The authors would like to thank in particular the senior and other involved officials of the Department of Peacekeeping Operations for their openness in sharing information and analyses. We are also grateful to the officials from the relevant regional divisions of the Department of Political Affairs, who agreed to be interviewed, for their willingness to provide valuable elements to assess the situation conditioning UN intervention. Very welcome also was the help of those who facilitated contacts with persons who had held key responsibilities in relation to the peace missions under consideration. All of them deserve credit for their support to this project.

A special word of recognition goes to Jean-Marie Guehenno, who generously dedicated his time and attention to share his views and look at parts of the draft. His analysis and suggestions were very useful in giving shape to the study. We are particularly grateful to Ramesh Thakur and Lise Morjé Howard, who agreed to review the full draft and made very helpful comments and suggestions to improve it, and to Iqbal Riza for his constant support. Acknowledgement should also go to Juan Garrigues, working for FRIDE at the initial stage of the project, for his good preparatory work and for first conceptualising and formulating the initial draft project proposal, and to Ana Martingui for her help with the final text.

Prior to its completion, this study was presented to selected groups of scholars and policy-makers in Paris, London and Stockholm in the course of pre-launch meetings. Participants made most valuable contributions to the formulation of the conclusions. Special thanks should go to the *Délégation aux Affaires Stratégiques* of the Ministry of Defence of France for hosting and co-organising the meeting in Paris; the European Council on Foreign Relations (ECFR), whose valuable support facilitated the holding of the meeting in London; and the Swedish Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Folke Bernadotte Academy for hosting the Stockholm event.

ACRONYMS

ACO	Allied Command Operations
AFRC	Armed Forces Revolutionary Council
AIEC	Afghan Independent Electoral Commission
AIHRC	Afghan Independent Human Rights Commission
ANA	Afghan National Army
ANDS	Afghanistan National Development Strategy
ANP	Afghan National Police
APC	All Peoples Congress
ARTF	Afghan Reconstruction Trust Fund
AU	African Union
AWN	Afghan Women's Network
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CDF	Civil Defence Forces
CDG	Consultation and Drafting Group
CENTCOM	United States Central Command
CIC	Centre on International Cooperation
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States

COM JFCN	Commander of Joint Force Command Naples
COMKFOR	Commander Kosovo Force
CSTC-A	Combined Security Transition Command–Afghanistan
CSTO	Collective Security Treaty Organisation
DDA	District Development Assembly
DDR	Disarmament, Demobilisation and Reintegration
DIAG	Disbandment of Illegal Armed Groups
DPKO	Department of Peacekeeping Operations
DSRSG	Deputy Special Representative of the Secretary-General
ECOMICI	ECOWAS Mission in Côte d'Ivoire
ECOMOG	Economic Community of West African States Monitoring Group
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
ESDP	European Security and Defence Policy
EU	European Union
EULEX	European Union Rule of Law Mission in Kosovo
FANCI	National Armed Forces of Côte d'Ivoire
FN	Forces Nouvelles
FRY	Federal Republic of Yugoslavia
FSS	Department of Field Support Services
FYROM	Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HDZ	Croatian Democratic Union

Security Council Resolutions Under Chapter VII

HRE	High Representative for the Elections
HRW	Human Rights Watch
HVO	Croatian Defence Council
IASC	Inter-Agency Standing Committee
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICG	International Crisis Group
ICO	International Civilian Office
ICR	International Civilian Representative
IDP	Internally Displaced Persons
IFS	International Friendship Service
IMATT	International Military Advisory and Training Team
IMTF	Integrated Mission Task Force
IOM	International Organisation for Migration
IPF	Ivorian Patriotic Front
ISAF	International Security Assistance Force
ISG	International Steering Group
IWG	International Working Group on Côte d'Ivoire
JCMB	Joint Coordination and Monitoring Board
JEMB	Joint Electoral Management Body
JFC	Joint Force Command
JIAS	Joint Interim Administrative Structure
KFOR	Kosovo Force

KLA/UÇK	Kosovo Liberation Army/ Ushtria Çlirimtare e Kosovës
KPC	Kosovo Protection Corps
KPS	Kosovo Police Service
KSF	Kosovo Security Force
KVM	Kosovo Verification Mission
KWN	Kosova Women's Network
LMA	Linas-Marcoussis Agreement
MARWOPNET	Mano River Union Women's Peace Network
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MINUCI	United Nations Mission in Côte d'Ivoire
MJP	Movement for Justice and Peace
MNB	Multinational Brigades
MNTF	Multinational Task Force
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MOWA	Ministry of Women's Affairs
MPCI	Patriotic Movement of Côte d'Ivoire
MPIGO	Ivorian Peoples' Movement for the Great West
NAC	North Atlantic Council
NAM	Non-Aligned Movement
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organisation
NCDDR	National Committee for Disarmament, Demobilisation and Rehabilitation

Security Council Resolutions Under Chapter VII

NEC	National Electoral Commission
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NPFL	National Patriotic Front of Liberia
NPRC	National Provisional Ruling Council
OAU	Organisation of African Unity
OCHA	United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
OEF	Operation Enduring Freedom
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
OPA	Ouagadougou Peace Agreement
OSCE	Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe
OSGAP	Office of the Secretary-General in Afghanistan and Pakistan
PBC	Peacebuilding Commission
PDCI	Democratic Party of Côte d'Ivoire
PDPA	People's Democratic Party of Afghanistan
PDSRSG	Principal Deputy Special Representative of the Secretary-General
PRIO	Peace Research Institute of Oslo
PRT	Provincial Reconstruction Teams
P5	Permanent Five
RDR	Rally of Republicans
ROE	Rules of Engagement
RTI	Ivorian National Television

RUF	Revolutionary United Front
RUFP	Revolutionary United Front Party
SCO	Shanghai Cooperation Organisation
SCR	Senior Civilian Representative
SHAPE	Supreme Headquarters Allied Power Europe
SLA	Sierra Leonean Army
SLPP	Sierra Leone People's Party
SNC	Serbian National Council
SRSR	Special Representative of the Secretary-General
SSR	Security Sector Reform
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
UAE	United Arab Emirates
UIF	United National Islamic Front for the Salvation of Afghanistan
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNAMA	United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan
UNAMSIL	United Nations Mission in Sierra Leone
UNCT	United Nations Country Team
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNGOMAP	United Nations Good Offices Mission in Afghanistan and Pakistan
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund

Security Council Resolutions Under Chapter VII

UNIFEM	United Nations Development Fund for Women
UNIOSIL	United Nations Integrated Office in Sierra Leone
UNIPSIL	United Nations Integrated Peacebuilding Office in Sierra Leone
UNMIK	United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo
UNMIL	United Nations Mission in Liberia
UNOCA	United Nations Office of the Coordinator for Afghanistan
UNOCI	United Nations Operation in Côte d'Ivoire
UNOMSIL	United Nations Observer Mission in Sierra Leone
UNOWA	United Nations Office for West Africa
UNPREDEP	United Nations Preventive Deployment Force
UNPROFOR	United Nations Protection Force
UNSMIA	United Nations Special Mission to Afghanistan
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNV	United Nations Volunteer
US	United States
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WIPSEN-Africa	Women Peace and Security Network Africa

Security Council Resolutions Under Chapter VII

We manage 18 operations deployed across 12 time zones in five continents, comprising 140,000 authorised personnel, of which 110,000 are currently deployed, directly impacting the lives of hundreds of millions of people. This compares to 30,000 deployed personnel from just 10 years ago.

Alain Le Roy, 1 December 2008

There is no sign that the need for peacekeeping will diminish. Threats such as environmental changes, economic shocks, transnational crime and extremism threaten many states and contribute to growing political and security instability.

UN 'New Horizon' internal paper, quoted in *The Financial Times*, 3 August 2009

So we need mission mandates that are more credible and achievable. We need peacekeeping operations to be planned expertly, deployed quickly, budgeted realistically, equipped seriously, led ably, and ended responsibly.

Ambassador Susan E. Rice, US Permanent Representative to the United Nations, remarks at New York University's Centre for Global Affairs and the Centre on International Cooperation, 'A New Course in the World, a New Approach at the UN', 12 August 2009

Concerns had been voiced [...] that United Nations peacekeeping was dysfunctional, because the troops the United Nations deployed – troops mostly from developing countries – were often ill-equipped, ill-trained and ill-prepared [...] if developing countries would stop responding to the frantic calls of the United Nations today, there would be no peacekeeping tomorrow, barring a few choicest areas in the world of strategic interest to major powers. Blaming the failure on the peacekeepers was the easy way out of meeting the Organisation's collective responsibility.

Ambassador Anawrul Kadim Chowdhury, Permanent Representative of Bangladesh to the United Nations, statement at a Security Council session on the situation of Sierra Leone, 11 May 2000

FOREWORD

Overstretched and under-funded, yet irreplaceable to achieve universal legitimacy, and in ever-increasing demand, United Nations peacekeeping missions have undergone a dramatic shift over the last decade.

So has the world. New actors and new alliances are changing the global balance of power. The UN of today is very different from the world organisation we used to know. Its ways and means of keeping and making peace are changing, and we have seen how other international organisations have stepped in, be it in the name of regional stability, the fight against global terrorism, to support an elected government under attack or for 'humanitarian intervention'.


This has happened without much public debate. General knowledge of the new circumstances conditioning the tasks of conflict prevention and peacekeeping remains limited outside government offices and political and diplomatic circles.

The inspiration for initiating this academic study, commissioned by the Madrid-based think-tank FRIDE and funded by the Government of Sweden, came from the privilege of having been given the confidence to head a major peacekeeping mission.

As the Special Representative of the Secretary-General (SRSG) in Côte d'Ivoire from 2005 to 2007, I experienced the peacekeeping responsibilities and conditions in the field and 'from within'. The proximity to the realities on the ground, characterised by images of violence, greed and human suffering, but also of ordinary people's hopes in the UN and their struggle for a better future, was a powerful reminder of the importance of UN peacekeeping. But there was also frustration; when the gap between noble prescriptions and possible actions became too wide.

The study *Security Council Resolutions under Chapter VII: Design, Implementation and Accountabilities. The Cases of Afghanistan, Côte d'Ivoire, Kosovo and Sierra Leone* deliberately examines widely different operations, thus reflecting the multiple challenges facing contemporary peacekeeping.

In reviewing the mandates, the political and material support for their implementation, the contribution of regional actors to the peace process and the local context, the research largely followed the broad lines set out in the Brahimi Report, to this date the broadest review and reform proposal for UN peacekeeping since the end of the Cold War.



It has also tested its findings against the four templates of the UN Department of Peacekeeping Operations and the Department of Field Support document 'Peacekeeping Operations 2010', which is based on lessons learned on peacekeeping over the past six decades.

This work comes at a particularly critical juncture for peacekeeping operations and international intervention in general. In the past five years, the Security Council has been asked to intervene under the provisions of Chapter VII of the UN Charter in situations of increasing diversity and complexity.

The growing number of operations under the Council's watch evidences its continuous central importance in maintaining peace and security. However, it also brings to the forefront inherent weaknesses, revealing contradictions within the international community over intervention policies.

During the immediate post-Cold War period, the rich countries allied with the West – and subsequently with the UN – had in the eyes of many experts gone beyond the level of international consensus. The original basic tenets of UN peacekeeping were altered by intervention in situations where there was no peace to keep. Impartiality, consent and non-use of force except for situations of self-defence, which the Brahimi Report recognises as the 'bedrock principles' of UN peacekeeping, were put to the test when confronted with intra-state transnational conflicts.

In this context, the Security Council authorised security enforcement missions led by regional organisations or interested states in parallel to UN-led peacekeeping and peacebuilding ones. This poses a new set of problems for UN civilian missions deployed in conjunction with such enforcement operations, as illustrated in this study.

The disposition of member states, especially from developed nations, to send their troops and resources to defuse or resolve distant wars has dwindled in the face of uncertain results. The capacity of the United Nations to respond effectively to crises is severely strained.

Warning voices about the dangers of overstretching have come from the UN itself. Jean-Marie Guéhenno, former Under-Secretary-General of the Department of Peacekeeping Operations, told *The Financial Times* in July 2008 'We are reaching the outer limits of peacekeeping'. Yet, the demand for UN peacekeeping continues.

The approval of landmark resolutions related to the human rights of non-combatants in situations of armed conflict – resolutions 1325 (2000) and 1820 (2008) on women, peace and security; 1612 (2005) on children and armed conflict; and 1674 (2006) on the protection of civilians in armed conflict – is a positive trend.

While not specific to any case in particular, these resolutions signal a resolve to eradicate the kind of abuse that came to the world's attention in the 1990s during the armed conflicts that ravaged the Mano River region in Liberia and Sierra Leone, the Great Lakes in Central Africa and the Balkans in Europe.

Security Council Resolutions Under Chapter VII

This research focuses on Security Council resolution 1325 (2000), whose application in its three dimensions – protection, participation and promotion of women – constitutes a strong potential for increased security and change in post-conflict societies. The four case studies show beyond any doubt that the UN and its member states have failed in implementing this resolution.

This study seeks to enhance understanding of the mandates, their design and implementation, and of the dynamics between the Council and the operations authorised in the four cases under review, and thus intends to serve as ‘food for thought’ for upcoming operations.

In addition, it aims to provide information and analysis that can contribute to the mobilisation of public support for UN peacekeeping as a tool of the international community to help countries emerging from war in their efforts to consolidate peace and improve their people’s lives.

Pierre Schori

Director General, FRIDE, Madrid